Evaluation of the Consultative Partnership Process between the Implementing Partners and the Community Policing Forums, for the GTZ project 'Gender Responsive Community Based Policing'

April 26 – May 17, 2010

Submitted to: GTZ, Richard Miles, Principal Advisor

Submitted by: Nicola Main-Thomson, Consultant

**Evaluation of the Consultative Partnership Process
between the Implementing Partners and the Community Policing Forums,
for the project 'Gender Responsive Community Based Policing'**

1. Introduction

The purpose of this report is to share the formative evaluation findings of the consultative partnership process GTZ is facilitating between the project implementing partners (IPs) and the community policing forums (CPF's) in the four project sites.

This report has been written for the German Technical Cooperation Bangladesh (GTZ Bangladesh).

2. Project Profile

GTZ Bangladesh along with Ministry of Women and Children Affairs, Government of Bangladesh, is implementing a 'Gender Responsive Community Based Policing' project. It is a component of the larger program, "Promotion of the Legal and Social Empowerment of Women".

The overall objective of the program is to strengthen the capacity of national and local institutions at formal and informal levels to deliver improved access to justice for women.

This project component aims to implement gender responsive community based policing as a prevention strategy against violence and crime.

Project interventions include:

- Installing gender responsive community policing strategies and systems
- Enhancing capacity of communities and the police to implement gender responsive community based policing
- Establishing effective communication strategies
- Establishing links between various existing programmes and approaches related to gender responsive community based policing

3. Evaluation Profile

The objective of this consultancy is to conduct a formative evaluation of the consultative partnership process between the four project implementing partners and the selected CPF's. Formative evaluations *"strengthen or improve the object being evaluated – they help form it by examining the delivery of the program or technology, the quality of its implementation, and the assessment of the organizational context, personnel, procedures, inputs, and so on."* (William, M.K. Trochim, 2006).

GTZ undertook this evaluation to remain consistent with its commitment to perform systematic and timely evaluations to ensure the approach undertaken is an effective strategy to achieve a successful implementation of this component of the program, Promotion of the Legal and Social Empowerment of Women.

The 'consultative process' is the approach undertaken by GTZ to facilitate project implementation. It refers to the coordination and partnering within this project between the project partners and primary stakeholders:
- Between GTZ and the four IPs (all of which are Bangladesh NGOs) - Lighthouse, Madaripur Legal Aid Association (MLAA), Sabalamby Unnayan Samity (SUS), and Rangpur Dinajpur Rural Service (RDRS)
- Between the four IPs and the CPF's they are supporting
- Between the CPF's, their communities, and the police

As per the request of GTZ, the evaluation was carried out with CPF members and not with the IPs.

As per the request of GTZ, the evaluation has been designed to capture the CPF members' perception of the implementing partners' approach to partnering. The evaluation has ensured a statistically acceptable level of representation per project site.

4. Methodology

An 'appreciative inquiry' method was used for this evaluation. This approach enabled the evaluator to explore and expose what has worked in these partnerships rather than focusing on problems which require fixing. Appreciative inquiry looks at what is working well and uses this to inform future practice. This does not mean that identified problems are ignored. Rather, the appreciative approach embraces the full range of responses and then attempts to focus attention on generating positive insights for future practice.

For each IP, an evaluation was performed. For 3 of the partners (RDRS, SUS, MLAA), a minimum of 12 CPF's participated in the evaluation. For Light House which supports additional CPF's, 18 CPF's participated in the evaluation.

The evaluation with the CPF's was comprised of 4 steps, looking at:

- What is 'community based policing'

- What are CPF's primary relationships

- 'Who did what' in the organizing of a trust building activity

- The implementing partners and gender equality

To provide direction and to substantiate the findings, the terms of references of the IPs present and previous contracts were reviewed.

The evaluation was undertaken in April and May 2010 over the course of 22 days. The evaluation was carried out in each of the implementing partners' project sites – Thakurgaon (RDRS), Bogra (Light House), Mymensingh (SUS), and Madaripur (MLAA).

The evaluation team was comprised of 2 people – the evaluator and translator. Due to the initial translator falling ill, a translator replacement was provided mid-way through the evaluation.

The evaluation methodology was designed to maximise participation in the evaluation and to facilitate an understanding of how the implementing partners operate. Areas of concern addressed in the design of the evaluation included: level of education of participants; urban vs rural experiences of the participants; and women's participation. The evaluation was carried out in Bangla and used evaluation techniques, such as illustrations on flipchart paper, to facilitate the gathering of ideas and perceptions in a bi-lingual evaluation environment.

The evaluation collected extensive information and insight into the implementing partners' implementation approach. For the purpose of this evaluation, the CPF members' perception of the reality provided the required insight. However, the evaluation is limited to the inherent shortcomings of conducting an evaluation in a second language and the full dependency on a translator.

5. Evaluation Findings

The findings are a summary of all four implementing partners' experiences. Separate reports with specific findings have been prepared for each IP; GTZ is sharing these reports with the respective partners only.

5.1 Partnering Style

GTZ has contracted four implementing partners for GRCBP in four districts in Bangladesh. Not only are the districts distinct but so are the IPs. Each IP has its own approach to implementing the project even though they share the same goal.

The selected IPs are respected by donors, other NGOs, their local communities, and the government in Bangladesh. They have institutional strengths that above all else guide them in their vision and day-to-day operations. Over their many years of implementing projects and providing services, these IPs have learned what works in their communities and how best to realize the goals of the work they carry out.

Shedding light on the implementation style of each IP will assist GTZ to understand the various implementation methodologies and adapt the individual implementation plans accordingly.

5.1.1 The primary differences between the IPs can be understood by looking at the differences between the urban and rural operating environments.

Rural communities are self reliant. They are often outside the purview of government consideration or services. The result is a "pull up your socks" mentality. They rely on themselves for their survival as a community and in more extreme cases for their survival as human beings. Acceptance and legitimacy of NGOs, or in this case IPs, providing services to a rural area has to be earned by outsiders; it is much more automatic for insiders. Rural communities are an informal web of individuals, families, community groups, NGOs working together to realize the community's potential.

In contrast, people living in urban areas have a more formal way of operating. Most urban centres have considerable government support and services and there are formalised mechanisms for accessing services. The formalised approach pervades the many aspects of urban living and reaches into the more personal areas of peoples' lives and how they interact and relate with their neighbours and their community. Many people living in the urban areas have moved there and do not have the long lineage of family and neighbourly relations that they may have had in their home village. In the more urban areas, community groups and services are more structured, requiring formal requests, appointments, and respect for organisational and institutional hierarchies.

5.1.2 The four implementing partners of GRCBP reflect the urban and rural differences.

One of the IPs is a rural organization. It has many active members working to realize their communities' and district's development, often on a voluntary basis. One of the CPF members, when asked about how information is shared between their CPF and the community, explained 'it is not like a task, we are all together, the community is the same people as us'. There is continuous informal sharing of information between CPF members, the IP staff, and their shared community. This informal sharing of information has value yet it is rarely recognized in project designs or measured. For this project, it is an important mechanism for trust building between the CPF's and the communities.

One of the IPs is more urban-based. They operate as an urban organization, respecting the importance of strong formal relationships in their town. Their operational approach respects the urban environment with structured and formalized relationships, and respects the importance of hierarchy of the formalized services structures. It is a required approach which reflects the urban and peri-urban reality that there are fewer informal discussions between neighbours because there is less chance they know each other and have the trust of each other as in the rural areas. Even though it is an urban approach, this partnering style has also proven to be effective with their rural partners.

Two of the IPs have turned to using mobile phones to assist them to straddle the urban and rural divide. They use mobile phones as a way of complementing the formal monthly CPF meetings. It is an effective informal means of communicating with the CPF members daily and weekly to discuss CPF activities, difficulties, achievements, etc.

One of the IPs whose primary focus is to support rural communities in their area, are implementing the project outside their district. To overcome the challenges of being an outsider and not having the automatic accessibility and legitimacy of coming from the communities where they are operating, they are visiting the communities regularly and also phoning the CPF members 4 -5 times per week to formally and informally chat about the progress of the project. With the use of the mobile phone, they are becoming accepted community workers.

The other IP is embedded in their community and operates as both an urban and rural organization. They already have the required legitimacy in both the rural and urban areas to support the CPF's. They clearly place emphasis on the formalized and structured approaches to implementing a project. However, they also integrate the CPF members into their other related projects which results in a lot of contact with the CPF members. They also communicate informally with the CPF members, using the phone to reach the rural CPF's.

5.1.3 All four implementing partners received very positive comments about their individual approach of facilitating the CPF meetings, discussions, and providing support. The IPs were seen to facilitate rather than direct meetings. They promoted women's involvement and participation. They made themselves available upon request. They provided technical and resource support as required.

Recommendations
Gender responsive community based policing is a pilot project for GTZ and for Bangladesh which means one of GTZ objectives is to explore and understand the appropriateness of the project objective and implementation approach within Bangladesh.

It is recommended GTZ reflects on the different IP operating styles and, in light of what they are trying to achieve, identifies which approaches works best in which environment, taking into account the differences in the districts and the differences between the urban, peri-urban, and rural.

It is recommended that GTZ promotes the use of mobile phones as a means of communicating and building of relationships and partnerships. It is a less formal way of communicating but equally effective. If GTZ chooses to support this initiative, the IPs will need to include in their reporting to GTZ, the approximate frequency of these informal communications, the topics discussed, and outcomes to which the phone calls can be attributed.

5.2 Implementation approach
This evaluation looked at the approach the implementing partners are using to support and build the capacity of the CPF's. The task of carrying out an event that would contribute to the building of trust between the CPF's, community, and police was examined as a means of understanding the various approaches used. It was also a task that women CPF members could be involved in.

5.2.1 All four IPs are savvy and understand funder requirements and the classic project management approach of measuring outputs, outcomes and results. The trust building activity tasked to the implementing partners was treated by the implementing partners as a required project output, such as, "successfully organized and delivered an inter-community football match". To their credit, each partner organized successfully a trust building activity culminating in well attended events in the respective communities.

However, when looking at the task through a process lens, the result to be achieved was not only the organization of a successful football match, community fair, or cooking competition but that the activity contributed to trust building between the CPF's, communities, and police, and that women CPF members were equally involved in the organizing of the events.

5.2.2 Each IP approached the trust building task differently. There were committees formed, tasks assigned, participants invited, and chief guests invited to give out prizes. Every step to organizing such an event was an opportunity to build the capacity of the CPF, potentially involve community or police, and to include women CPF members. This was achieved to varying degrees by the IPs.

One IP created a sub-committee to organize their local event and to facilitate the intra-CPF meetings. The committee was made up of the Chairs, Vice Chairs, and Secretaries of the participating CPF's. As none of these positions were held by women, no women were involved. This is in contrast to another IP that created an intra-CPF committee but stipulated that 30% had to be women. This approach enabled the CPF's to come together to organize their event efficiently and effectively, and contributed to the women's involvement and the building of their capacity as equal members of the CPF's.

For the football matches organized, one of the IPs had the CPF's playing against each other. One of the other IPs invited community members to play on the football teams. Having the teams made up of CPF members will have contributed to building the relationship between the different CPF's which is important. Having the teams made up of community members will have contributed to the trust building between the CPF's and the communities which was the purpose of this task.

At all of the trust building events, involvement of the police was extremely limited. For some of the events, the police provided minimal security. On some of the football teams, one police officer was invited to play on each team, and at the match there were some police who showed up to watch the game. For others, the only involvement of the police was at the prize giving ceremony where the Superintendent (SP) or Officer in Charge (OC) was invited as Chief Guest and requested to award the prize.

The IPs' involvement in inviting the police varied. One of the IPs did all the corresponding and contacting of the police, on behalf of the CPF's. The other IPs played a role in the relationship building but not to the same extent.

Further details of the organizing of the events are in the individual reports for each IP.

Recommendations
The key to successfully contributing to trust building is appropriate involvement of the communities, police, and CPF female members.

Communities
At all the events the communities were involved in varying degrees. One of the IPs had the community members play on their football team. Another of the IPs rented out stalls to the community members to sell their wares at the organised fair. The communities were invited to attend all the event days and they did attend. In some cases, the women did not attend the football matches. It is recommended in future IPs and CPF's together consider additional ways of involving the community in the events. Increased involvement will further the CPF's relationship with their communities and if the police are also involved, will contribute to initiating and furthering their relationship with the police.

Police
Some of the CPF members commented that the event days did more in awareness-raising than trust building. For others, they commented that there was some trust building as a result of the event day. They said that following the event, the police were more approachable. In another community, the SP shared his mobile phone number at the event inviting the community to phone him should they require police assistance – a step in the right direction to building trust. The extent of the trust building was not measured in this evaluation but what can be surmised is that increased involvement of the police in each and every CPF task will speed up the trust building between the community policing partners.

One of the primary challenges of forging a long term relationship with the police as a community policing partner is that at present, the relationships are at the individual level with no institutional commitment from

the police to work alongside the GTZ project. It is recommended GTZ continues to attribute sufficient resources to building institutional trust and commitment to community policing. Without this commitment, and with the continuous transfer of SPs and OCs to various districts around the country, the very foundation of community policing, trust between police, community, and CPF's, will only be as good as the SP and OC in the project's respective implementation sites. At the same time, it is recommended the CPF's continue to work on their relationship with the police, recognizing that the police is not only the SP and OC but is made up of many other police officers that if convinced of community policing, will contribute to police support and commitment for community based policing.

To maximize the relationship building with the police, it is recommended that GTZ reminds the IPs that their role is to facilitate the relationship between the police and the communities. As long as the CPF's and/or police consider the IP as their communication link between the two, the building of a trusting relationship will be hampered. There is also the risk that the IPs end up making themselves an invaluable component of community policing. In this case, there is no possibility of sustainability.

The one caveat to this is that this project is being implemented within specific social contexts. For each implementing partner, they have unique localized challenges to build trust with communities, and with police who may or may not support or understand the benefits of cooperating with the Gender Responsive Community Policing project. It is the role of GTZ to continue their efforts to influence perceptions and views of the Bangladesh Police, and the funder, UNDP, to promote community policing as an effective strategy to crime prevention as has been proven throughout the world.

Women
The involvement of women varied between the CPF's. Generally speaking, the CPF's worked within their gender-defined social boundaries which differ in each community. One of the IPs took the creative step and organized women's games (pass the pillow, musical chairs, etc.) to increase women's involvement in the trust building task while remaining within the accepted social norms. For others, there was a minimal tokenism of women CPF members' involvement. As mentioned above, one of the IPs required 30% women's involvement in the organizing of their events. To move the gender equality agenda forward, the CPF's need to gently push the social boundaries and require 30% involvement of women in all CPF tasks, to give them the opportunity to participate equally with their male counterparts. At this early stage of women's involvement, the CPF's may want to assign certain tasks for women that are more in line with Bangladesh gender divisions of labour. For example, instead of the women doing the physical work of organizing the Special Guest table for a football match, the women could draft and prepare the invitations for the special guests – a task of equal importance but requiring different skills.

It is recommended the gender training for the implementing partners and CPF members explores what gender equality means for the CPF's and community-based policing. "Gender roles are not neutral, but connected with different options, rights and decision-making possibilities." (Steps for Action to promote gender equality, GTZ, 2009) The CPF's can decide how gender roles would look in their forum and work towards the realisation of these roles as an institutional goal.

5.3 Women's Empowerment
For GTZ, *gender-responsive* community based policing requires an increase in women's participation in the prevention of crimes, and requires an improved response to women-related crimes.

5.3.1 GTZ has requested all CPF's have a minimum of 30% women members. The implementing partners are working towards this goal. Some CPF's have surpassed 30% representation, others are lagging behind.

Recommendations
This is a similar approach to the government quota system of reserving a minimum number of seats for women in the national and local elections. It is a means of moving the country closer to realizing its constitutional commitment to gender equality.

Those CPF's without the 30% representation must make this a priority.

5.3.2 It is understood well in development that 'participation' is an ambiguous term with it ranging from passive to active. To understand the extent and achievement of the women CPF members' participation, it is important to understand that each woman comes to the CPF at their own unique stage of empowerment. For some women, attending the CPF meetings is the first time that they have been able to leave their homes without a male family member chaperone. For these woman, to attend meetings, even in a passive role, is an achievement of this project's contribution to women's empowerment and gender equality. Other women CPF members are already experiencing a higher level of empowerment and, for example, may be attending the local college. For these woman, having their voices heard and respected by their CPF member peers is an achievement which moves them a step further towards empowerment and equality with men.

There is already a significant increase in women's participation on the CPF's since GTZ's intervention to activate the existing CPF's. Before GTZ's involvement the participation of women on CPF's was almost non-existent. The women's voices on the CPF's vary in strength and determination but their voice is there and it is heard. As the project progresses and the men realize the women's positive contribution, the women's voices will become stronger. The 30% representation quota is a means of giving women a collective voice at the CPF's, and gives individual women the moral support they need to express their opinion at the CPF meetings on preventing crime and promoting security in their community.

Increased women's participation on CPF's is contributing to an improved response to women-related crimes. The women who have mobility are accessing the private domain in which violence against women (VAW) mostly occurs. They are gathering information and bringing it to their CPF's for consideration on how to respond. Also, there was a consensus by all participants that female victims may, and in some cases, are seeking help from women CPF members which they wouldn't do with male CPF members. For those women CPF members who may also be victims of domestic violence, understanding their rights will assist them to seek assistance which they would not have done otherwise.

Recommendations
It is recommended that the implementing partners remain vigilant in their goal to increasing women's participation. To realize this goal, IPs need to understand and accept that women's advancement is not the same for each woman. Each woman will progress at a different rate due to her personal and family environment and the societal values and beliefs that she has adopted throughout her life.

It is recommended that GTZ, as part of its training component, discusses women's empowerment as CPF empowerment, and discusses it from the woman's individual perspective, understanding it as a personal road of discovery for each female member. It is recommended that these women's achievements are celebrated by the CPF's. Furthermore, it is recommended this appreciation of women's empowerment is shared with the project donors to assist their understanding of the complexity of women's advancement and to celebrate GRCBP's contribution to gender equality, at the individual, CPF, and community level.

6. Risks
6.1 Intellectually, the CPF members understand their role is to prevent crimes occurring and to solve local problems, thus contributing to a safe and secure community. The reality is that CPF members in all four implementing sites mentioned most frequently their role as a CPF is to solve problems in their community. There is a risk that their good intentioned responses to the needs in the community overstep the line of prevention. Alternative dispute mechanisms are available in communities to resolve local issues locally and NGOs and funders are working hard to ensure disputes being handled by this process are solved in a fair, equitable, and gender-sensitive manner. CPF members are not trained sufficiently in human rights, including women's rights, Bangladesh laws, or in the skills of how to facilitate a resolution fairly. CPF's, shalishes, police, etc. complement each other but the responsibilities should not overlap. There is a risk that

as the project progresses and the CPF's continue and further their role in their communities to resolve disputes, the delineation of responsibilities will become blurred.

6.2 Problems facing communities in Bangladesh as anywhere in the world vary in breadth, depth, scope, and importance. In the context of crime prevention and improved security, communities may identify numerous issues that they believe contribute to crime and reduced security. These issues can be as small or as big as communities wanting the speed limit to be reduced on a local road as a means to reducing traffic accidents, the removal of trees next to pathways to increase personal safety, and the interception of drugs into a community as a way of reducing petty criminal activities such as theft. In this project, all CPF members referred to their local problems as: eve teasing, rape, early marriage, violence against women, gambling, and drugs. This limited list of local problems and the fact that it was a shared opinion in all 4 sites, suggests that the IPs are using these problems as examples of where CPF's may intervene. The IPs may also be influenced by the NGO community, donors, media, and government, who refer to these problems as the primary social issues facing Bangladesh currently. The risk is that CPF members fail to see the much larger picture of what non-political issues concern their communities which they could tackle, positively impacting their communities' perception and reality of personal and family safety and security.

7. Implementing Partners' Good Practices (as identified by the CPF members)
- CPF members are *encouraged* to share their ideas and opinions
- CPF's are *consulted*
- IPs *facilitate* capacity building
- IPs *listen* to CPF members
- Technical and logistical support is provided to the CPF's as required
- Relevant training has been provided. At present, training has only been delivered to a few members of each CPF. CPF members would like all members to receive the training.
- There is importance given to *women's opinions* at CPF monthly meetings
- Implementing partners make themselves available to the CPF's when required
- Support should continue until the CPF's are able to stand on their own two feet

8. Conclusions
8.1 The implementing partners are rising to the challenge of introducing a modern approach to policing in Bangladesh that is yet to be implemented by the Bangladesh Police. It is a challenging goal that implementing partners and the community policing forum members are expending extraordinary amounts of personal time and energy to achieve.

8.2 GTZ continues to highlight the importance of creating genuine partnerships and to focus on the process of developing and/or transforming existing relationships into constructive and functioning partnering to prevent crime and promote safety and security.

8.3 The IPs' implementation approach is appreciated by the CPF members.

8.4 The project would benefit from continued discussions concerning the partnership ethos introduced at the beginning of the project (civility, equality, openness, honesty, respect, support, communication, agreement, joint ownership, honest feedback, and accountability).

8.5 The CPF's are not all progressing at the same speed in terms of women's involvement, using the process to build partnerships, and actual partnership building with their communities and the police. The IPs would do well to remain cognizant of the differences between the CPF's and adjust their strategies accordingly.

8.6 The project would benefit from training on the importance of implementation processes and their impact on project outcomes and results.

8.7 The IPs would benefit from sharing with each other their implementation experiences including how they are overcoming local challenges.

8.8 Women's involvement in the CPF's is increasing and their voices are getting stronger. To further these achievements, the CPF's would benefit from gender equality training, including, understanding gender equality in the context of CPF's, understanding women's empowerment as an individual journey of transformation, and celebrating the small achievements of women CPF members as CPF institutional achievements.

8.9 With GRCBP firmly in the implementation phase of the project, with the TPP signed by the Government of Bangladesh in May 2010, it is recommended the project develop closer links, particularly for the sharing of information, with the other component of the program, Promotion of the Legal and Social Empowerment of Women.

9. Management Response
9.1 Brief introduction about the utility of the report
Initial findings of the evaluation were shared with the Principal Advisor at the end of the mission. The discussion provided the necessary opportunity to place findings and issues into required contexts for further analysis prior to writing this report.

9.2 Acceptance of the findings and recommendations
The initial findings shared were accepted by the Principal Advisor. The Principal Advisor indicated that upon receiving the final report with recommendations consideration would be given to introducing the proposed recommendations to the degree that they contribute to fulfilling the GTZ commitment to implementing a gender responsive community policing project as defined in the agreement with the donor, the Royal Netherlands Embassy and the Ministry of Women and Children Affairs.